

## Decline in Number and Scope of CSB Report Recommendations

Below is a comparison of the “Moure-Eraso Cases” with the later period, the “Sutherland Cases,” when Vanessa Sutherland was the CSB leader, as Chair. Ms. Sutherland resigned from the CSB effective in June of 2018.

Excluded from this analysis are those investigations that were initiated and substantially investigated before Moure-Eraso became Chair (in late June 2010), but for which the final reports were issued under Moure-Eraso. Likewise excluded from the “Sutherland Cases” are any cases that were initiated and substantially investigated before she became the Chair in August 2015.

	<u>Total Recommendations</u>	<u>Regulatory</u>	<u>Consensus Standards</u>
<b>Moure-Eraso Cases</b>			
Hoeganaes	13	3	1
DuPont Buffalo	4	0	0
Donaldson	12	2	1
Carbide	3	0	1
Deepwater 1&2	4	1	2
Tesoro	16	3	2
AL Solutions	4	0	0
Key Lessons	0	0	0
US Ink	8	2	0
Millard	0	0	0
Horsehead	0	0	0
Chevron	37	13	7

TOTAL	101	24	14
<b>AVERAGE</b>	<b>8.4</b>	<b>2.0</b>	<b>1.2</b>
<b>Sutherland Cases<sup>1</sup></b>			
Arkema	5	0	0
Packaging Corp.	1	0	0
MGPI Processing	5	0	0
Exxon Baton Rouge	0	0	0
Delaware Refining	0	0	0
AirGas	6	0	3
TOTAL	17	0	3
<b>AVERAGE</b>	<b>2.8</b>	<b>0.0</b>	<b>0.5</b>

Significantly, the investigations that were initiated and completed fully within Ms. Sutherland’s nearly three-year term contained no regulatory recommendations at all, compared to approximately 24 regulatory recommendations during Dr. Moure-Eraso’s four year and nine-month term.

In addition, Ms. Sutherland’s six cases included far fewer total recommendations of any kind, and fewer recommendations even for any changes to voluntary consensus standards that might inform regulators’ actions under various general duty clauses and the OSHA Process Safety Management standard. Notably, the Sutherland Cases include no recommendations for any changes to consensus standards by the American Petroleum Institute, which develops widely

---

<sup>1</sup> Omits investigations that were substantially completed, and where the final draft reports and recommendations had been prepared, while Moure-Eraso was chairman and I was Managing Director, including Deepwater Horizon (Macondo) Parts 3 and 4, Caribbean Petroleum, and West Fertilizer. Also omits Tesoro Martinez, Freedom Industries, Exxon Torrance, and Williams Olefins investigations which were initiated and largely or partially investigated while Moure-Eraso was Chair and I was Managing Director. The final reports on the latter four cases, developed while Sutherland was Chair, included no regulatory recommendations.

followed voluntary standards for the oil and refining industry, whereas a number of such recommendations were issued during for the Moure-Eraso Cases.

###