

Memorandum

PRIVILEGED AND CONFIDENTIAL ATTORNEY OPINION WORK PRODUCT

To: File

From: Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LLP

Re: Renna Interview Memorandum

On Thursday, January 30, 2014, Christina Genovese Renna was interviewed by Randy M. Mastro, Alexander H. Southwell, Debra Wong Yang and Sarah Vacchiano of Gibson Dunn. During the interview, Renna was represented by Henry Klingeman of Krovatin Klingeman LLC. All information contained herein was provided by Renna or as indicated. The information in brackets was obtained from publicly-available sources, not from the interview itself. Renna has not read or reviewed the memorandum and has not adopted or approved its contents. Southwell began the interview by administering the standard *Upjohn* warnings per Gibson Dunn's protocol, and requesting that Renna refrain from discussing the investigation and interview with others. Renna stated that she agreed, understood, and did not have any questions.

This memorandum does not contain a verbatim transcript of what was said at the meeting; rather, it is a summary of the discussion that reflects counsel's mental thoughts and impressions and is therefore protected from disclosure by the attorney work product doctrine.

I. Background

[Renna graduated from St. Joseph's University and received a Master's in Public Administration from Villanova University.]

Prior to joining the Governor's Office in 2010, Renna served as a private legislative aide in District 1 in South New Jersey, then worked in the private sector before spending three years as a business lobbyist for the Chamber of Commerce of Southern New Jersey, a 501(c)(6) organization.

Renna stated that she kind of fell into her job with the Governor's Office. She did not work on the Governor's campaign in 2009, though she did vote for Governor Christie and is a registered Republican. Renna was introduced to Bill Stepien in 2009 by Pete Sheridan, a

mutual friend who thought Renna was a great fit for an open Business Affairs position within the Governor's Office.

Renna joined the Governor's Office in April 2010 as Director of Business Affairs within the Department of Legislative & Intergovernmental Affairs ("IGA"). In this role, Renna travelled the state to meet with small businesses and local chambers of commerce to discuss the Administration's economic development initiatives (Renna pointed out that this time period predated the Lieutenant Governor's principal focus on driving economic development issues). As Director of Business Affairs, Renna's primary objective was getting the Governor's name out among small businesses and focusing on economic development issues. In this role, Renna reported to former Director of IGA, Amanda Gasperino. When Gasperino left this position, Bridget Kelly assumed the role of Director of IGA and Renna reported to Kelly thereafter. Renna held the position of IGA Director of Business Affairs for approximately nine months. In winter 2011, Renna became the IGA Legislative Liaison, where she liaised with the New Jersey Assembly and ultimately the entire state legislature. Renna stayed in this role for approximately one year and then became IGA Director of Departmental Relations.

Renna described the Departmental Relations role as very different from her first two positions within IGA. As Director of Departmental Relations, Renna served as the intermediary between the State departments and the Governor's Office. For example, Renna served as the Governor's Office liaison with department commissioners, assisting the cabinet members to flag issues with the Administration and updating the Governor on projects the departments were working on. Renna also attended meetings between the department heads and the Governor's Office. Renna held the position of Director of Departmental Relations for approximately one year, and then was promoted to her current role of Director of Intergovernmental Affairs, Kelly's former position within the Governor's Office.

A. Role and Responsibilities

As Director of IGA, Renna said that she oversees 10 members of IGA staff divided into two teams of Regional Directors and Sandy Regional Directors. Non-Sandy Regional Directors serve as the points of contact for all local and county officials in the state, broken down by region. Sandy Regional Directors are uniquely focused on the 16 towns most severely impacted by Hurricane Sandy, and serve as points of contact for mayors and community groups in those towns. Both teams of regional staff spend the majority of their time on the road meeting with local officials and community groups.

When Renna first assumed the role of Director of Intergovernmental Affairs, she was only responsible for overseeing the team of Sandy Regional Directors. In June 2013, Renna's oversight role expanded to both teams of regional staff, although Renna stated that Sandy oversight had been her primary focus over the past year.

Renna said that her interactions vary between the two Regional Director teams. Due to the fact that the Sandy team is based fully on the road, Renna said she mainly approves various meetings the Sandy Regional Directors set up with local officials and community groups, and then requests updates and feedback from those meetings. Additionally, the Sandy team fields questions and requests from local officials and community groups, and then forwards these questions to Renna, who gathers information from Marc Ferzan and other officials from the Governor's Office of Recovery and Rebuilding ("GORR"). Renna said that GORR also provides input on various action items that Renna communicates to the Sandy team to take back to their regions' respective mayors and community groups.

Kelly was promoted to Deputy Chief of Staff for Legislative and Intergovernmental Affairs in or about April 2013. At that point, Renna characterized herself as the only other senior person in IGA aside from Kelly, and shortly thereafter, Renna defaulted into the role of unofficially being in charge of the non-Sandy regional staff. Renna was responsible for approving the Regional Directors' travel schedules making sure they showed up on time and did their jobs. Renna, however, had no involvement in hiring or termination decisions.

1. Regional Staff

IGA Regional Directors are collectively referred to as regional staff. Renna described the regional staff as "kids," in that many are recent college graduates and former interns with an interest in politics.

Renna described IGA's operations as constituent relations for local elected officials. In order to carry out IGA's goal of effecting "good government" practices, Renna said that she is responsible for overseeing the Regional Directors via a system of "checks and balances," wherein Renna reviews with whom the regional staff are meeting, as well as the timing and purpose of such meetings.

B. IGA Office Layout

When Stepien was IGA Deputy Chief of Staff, all IGA staff was located on the 4th floor of the State House. According to Renna, Stepien had a "bullpen" mentality; for approximately Renna's first 3 years in IGA, everyone had an office on the 4th floor.

Renna sat in a cubicle until Kelly was promoted to Stepien's position in April 2013. When Stepien left, Renna moved into Kelly's former office on the 2nd floor of the State House. Renna assumed Kelly's former title of Director of IGA, but Kelly did not transfer to Renna the same responsibilities. Renna recalled there was confusion among the office as to whether Renna would be overseeing all IGA staff. Renna sat in Kelly's old office until she was moved to the 4th floor IGA cubbyhole by Kelly around September 2013, because as Kelly explained at the time, the Chief Counsel's Office needed additional space. Based on the entirety of Renna's relationship with Kelly, Renna speculated that the real reason behind

the move was Kelly was intimidated by Renna, and furthermore, Renna perceived that Kelly consistently kept Renna at arm's length from anyone of importance in the Administration. Renna stayed in the IGA cubbyhole, and consequently, Renna sensed that a lot of people in the Governor's Office did not know Renna, due to the physically remote location of Renna's office.

C. Relationship with Bridget Kelly

Renna did not know Kelly until Renna's second year in IGA, when Gasparino left the office and Kelly became Renna's boss in 2011. Early on Renna and Kelly were as friendly as Kelly was with anybody in the office. Renna noted that Kelly was not close with anyone in the office except Stepien.

At first, Renna and Kelly would occasionally grab a drink after work, although they did not socialize outside of work on the weekends. But after Renna got married in July 2012, Renna noticed that their personal friendship diminished.

Renna explained that Kelly did not interact with many people in the office on a personal level, so she considered Kelly's behavioral change to be geared towards Renna specifically, and not reflective of a general behavioral change in Kelly. Renna noted that when Stepien was in IGA, he also only interacted with Kelly, and Kelly and Stepien's management style mirrored each other.

When Kelly moved downstairs, she set up the IGA flow chart differently. In addition to Renna, Vincent Napolitano and Kieran Tintle reported directly to Kelly. Renna considered Napolitano and Tintle to be her contemporaries in IGA. As Director of Constituencies, Napolitano oversaw the constituencies operation, serving as the liaison between the Governor's Office and the Jewish and Hispanic communities. Tintle took over Renna's role as Director of Legislative and Departmental Relations, which included proactive letter writing.

As Kelly got closer to filling Stepien's role as IGA Deputy Chief of Staff, Kelly became more distant from IGA staff. Based on speculation, Renna believed that if Stepien were to leave, Kelly would get his job.

D. IGA Culture and Management Style

Renna described Stepien as antisocial, but added that Stepien could be very pleasant when he wanted to be. Renna further characterized Stepien as brilliant but intimidating. Renna said that it was her perception that Kelly wanted to be like Stepien, but in Renna's opinion, Kelly was not nearly as intelligent as Stepien. Renna believed that Kelly emulated Stepien's management style and fell in line with whatever he wanted without question.

Renna described Kelly's demeanor as tough with an occasional bad temper. However, by the time Kelly headed the IGA office, the staff had experienced three years of a culture where people knew better than to ask questions or come close to overstepping—so in Renna's opinion, there were less reasons for Kelly to be angry because everyone already knew how IGA operated.

E. Additional IGA Staff

Renna said that Matt Mowers preceded Evan Ridley as Regional Director for the northern region of New Jersey, which includes Fort Lee. During this time, Renna was not overseeing the regional operations, so Mowers never worked for Renna. Renna opined that Mowers was young and ambitious, with a sharp political mind.

Ridley took over Mowers' position as Regional Director for the northern region when Mowers left IGA to work for Governor Christie's reelection campaign in 2013. Renna explained that Ridley currently oversees a "super region," because Kelly and Stepien were not inclined to hire additional people over the past year and Ridley's region encompasses multiple regions. Renna added that Stepien wanted Mowers on the campaign, so IGA assigned Ridley the super region to get through the campaign.

Professionally, Renna did not consider Ridley to be a strong performer.

Renna also considered Pete Sheridan—the person who got Renna the interview with Stepien in 2010—to be her contemporary within IGA. During the Governor's first term, Sheridan oversaw the geographic operations within IGA.

F. Use of Personal Emails

Renna explained that after she had been with IGA for one year, she recalled realizing that everyone around her was using a personal email account in addition to their government email accounts. Renna did not use a personal email address for work purposes during her first year in the Governor's Office. When Renna realized that everyone else was using a personal email account for work purposes, she created a Gmail account which she used for both work and personal matters. Renna stated that no one in the Governor's Office asked her to create a personal email account for work purposes.

Renna added that staffers in the field were given state Blackberries and able to access state email accounts on the road.

Renna did not recall discussions regarding the use of personal emails with Stepien or Kelly.

G. Other Interactions within the Governor's Office

In Renna's current role as Director of Intergovernmental Affairs, Renna rarely interacted with Maria Comella, the Deputy Chief of Staff for Communications and Planning. Renna interacted more with Comella when Renna was serving in the interdepartmental role.

In Renna's interdepartmental role, Renna stated that she interacted occasionally with Nicole Crifo in the Authorities Unit.

Renna recalled rarely interacting with David Wildstein—they interacted on no more than five occasions, and all during her second and third year in the Governor's Office when she was working on departmental matters. Renna also interacted with some younger folks who worked under Wildstein at the Port Authority.

Renna stated that Kelly and Wildstein talked all the time and were exceptionally close. Renna personally observed that Wildstein called Kelly frequently, but did not know if they socialized outside the office. Renna did not know why Kelly and Wildstein had such a close friendship. Renna speculated that since Stepien was friendly with Wildstein, and Kelly was Stepien's protégée, that could be the connection that bound Kelly and Wildstein.

Renna had absolutely no direct interactions with the Governor. Renna said that she did not directly interact with the Governor by phone, email or in person. At most, Renna would see the Governor at a town hall event or Drumthwacket, where the Governor might give Renna a hug and ask how her husband was doing.

H. Interactions with the Governor's Campaign

Beginning in July 2013, the IGA team went to go to campaign headquarters one evening a week and made volunteer calls on behalf of the Governor's reelection campaign. Kelly designated Wednesdays as "Bridgewater Wednesdays," on which IGA staff would leave the State House at 5:00 p.m. and spend a few hours making "get out the vote" calls on behalf of the Governor's reelection campaign. Renna participated each Wednesday. Kelly and Stepien also scheduled weekly conference calls on Saturday mornings between IGA staff and campaign staff.

Renna stated that IGA staff did not work on the campaign during normal business hours. It was well known from Stepien and Kelly that IGA staff could only work on the Governor's re-election campaign on vacation or spare time outside normal business hours.

1. Stepien's "Top 100 Towns" List

Renna explained that the focus of the regional team for four years was "good government across the board," which was implemented by managing constituent relations

with every elected official at both the local and county level. The “T-100” towns list was Stepien’s brainchild. Renna did not know how Stepien came up with the list—she specifically stated that the list was not based on town size—but she recalled being told anecdotally that Stepien was a brilliant mastermind of voting data and had compiled a list of key towns whose support for the Governor could grow. Renna said that following Hurricane Sandy, Stepien added 17 towns to the T-100 list, making it a T-117 list. Renna added that not all of the newly-added towns were added because of Hurricane Sandy. Renna said that the T-100 list was designed to focus on building stronger relationships for the Governor with those towns in particular. Renna used the T-100 list daily during the course of the work day, and considered it a helpful tool to aid IGA’s efforts to have the Governor visit a school or organize a town hall in certain towns in order to strengthen the Administration’s relationship with those towns.

Renna was not under the impression that the list was structured as a “good/bad” list. Renna emphasized that the T-100 list was reflective of IGA’s continuing focus on strengthening its constituent relations.

Renna did not perceive a cognizable pattern in the list of towns. To the contrary, Renna described the list as a “mixed bag of towns” that included urban, suburban and rural towns. The list includes more northern New Jersey towns than southern New Jersey towns, but Renna stated that demographics did not play a factor in compiling the list.

Renna said that within the Governor’s Office, IGA did not “drive” the Administration; rather, IGA was designed to be the link between getting on-the-ground information from local towns and counties and communicating that information to the high-level people and senior staff making the decisions.

2. List of Mayors

Renna believed Stepien kept track of mayors who were not in favor with IGA, but Renna was not privy to that process. But IGA staff would receive mandatory directives along the lines of “do not rush to return this mayor’s phone call.” Renna recalled an IGA staffer asking Renna, “Can we get a list of hands-off mayors?” Renna remembered responding, “You know we won’t get it, and it would change daily anyway.”

Renna could not think of an example of political retribution that would rise to the level of what is alleged was done with the George Washington Bridge. However, sometimes IGA staff received a directive along the lines of “no need to call to check in” with a local elected official, which was enough to send a message to the local elected official.

3. Stepien's Color-Coded Maps

Renna described Stepien as having different maps for different years posted on the walls of Stepien's office and multicolored pins strategically placed throughout the maps. Renna said that the multicolored pins represented towns in which the Governor held public events or IGA organized town halls; or, alternatively, mayors who had signed on to support the Governor's various initiatives, such as the Governor's 2.5 percent property tax cap plan from 2010.

4. Kelly's Poster of Names

Renna was shown a poster with a list of names taken from the wall of Kelly's office. Renna did not remember seeing this specific poster but was familiar with the names listed. Renna noted that in practice, she recalled Kelly making lists on whiteboards in her office, but Renna did not recall seeing a large poster in Kelly's office.

Renna speculated that the top names were "constituency guys." Renna then identified the names on the list, and specified to the best of her recollection whether or not the person endorsed the Governor.

- Mullen [*William T. Mullen, President of the New Jersey Building and Trades Council*]: Renna said Mullen is a building trades guy who is not a current friend of the Administration, though he used to be.
- Pocino [*Ray Pocino is on the Port Authority Board of Commissioners*]: Renna recalled Pocino endorsed the Governor and is considered a friend of the Administration.
- Jackson [*Bishop Reggie Jackson*]: Renna described Jackson as an African American community leader who Renna thinks endorsed the Governor.
- Kotler [*Rabbi Malkiel Kotler*]: Renna said Rabbi Kotler oversees the orthodox Jewish community in Lakewood, NJ. She recalled Rabbi Kotler endorsed the Governor. However, it was Renna's understanding that IGA was not working with Rabbi Kotler any longer.
- Stack [*Senator Brian Stack, 33rd Leg. District and Democratic Mayor of Union City*]: Renna recalled that Senator Stack endorsed the Governor.
- Diaz [*Wilda Diaz, Democratic Mayor of Perth Amboy City*]: Renna recalled that Mayor Diaz endorsed Barbara Buono.

- Gerbounka [*Richard Gerbounka, Mayor of Linden City*]: Renna recalled that Mayor Gerbounka endorsed the Governor.
- Stahl [*David Stahl, Mayor of East Brunswick Township*]: Renna recalled Mayor Stahl, a former Democrat, switched parties to run for State Senate as a Republican. Renna did not think Mayor Stahl ultimately endorsed the Governor but said that he could have been listed as a potential endorser when he was still a Democrat.
- McCormac [*John McCormac, Democratic Mayor of Woodbridge Township*]: Renna recalled Mayor McCormac endorsed the Governor in 2009 but not in 2013, but Renna described Mayor McCormac as a friend of the Administration.
- DelVecchio [*David DelVecchio, Democratic Mayor of Lambertville City*]: Renna recalled Mayor DelVecchio did not endorse the Governor.
- Sokolich [*Mark Sokolich, Democratic Mayor of Fort Lee*]: *had no recollection.*
- Kelly [*Albert Kelly, Mayor of Bridgeton City*]: Renna recalled that Mayor Kelly did not endorse the Governor.
- Hameeduddin [*Muhamad Hameeduddin, Mayor of Teaneck*]: Renna recalled Mayor Hameeduddin did not endorse the Governor.
- LaBarbiera [*Richard LaBarbiera, Democratic Mayor of Paramus*]: Renna did not recall whether Mayor LaBarbiera endorsed the Governor.
- Roque [*Felix Roque, Democratic Mayor of West New York*]: Renna recalled that Mayor Roque was a mayor who was indicted. She recalled the Administration had a working relationship with Mayor Roque before his indictment.
- Fulop [*Steven Fulop, Democratic Mayor of Jersey City*]: Renna did not know if Mayor Fulop was on the list of potential Governor endorsements.

I. Endorsement Efforts: Mayor Dawn Zimmer

Renna stated that Hoboken Mayor Zimmer was always on the list for potential Democrat endorsements, and then Renna recalled Mayor Zimmer's name came off the list. Renna recalled that IGA always had a "phenomenal working relationship" with Mayor Zimmer, even though Mayor Zimmer had made it clear that she was not going to endorse the Governor. Renna recalled the Governor was fine with Mayor Zimmer's non-endorsement. Renna added that she had a document indicating Stepien directed IGA to take Mayor Zimmer

off the list of potential endorsements in January 2013. Following that directive, the IGA office had a great working relationship with Mayor Zimmer.

Renna said that the Governor rarely solicited endorsements directly from mayors. It was Renna's understanding that the Governor personally requested Mayor Zimmer's endorsement, but Renna did not know this factually; rather, Renna's understanding is based on a conversation she had with Kelly, who thought that the Governor personally asked Mayor Zimmer to consider endorsing him during a meeting with Mayor Zimmer.

Even though Renna recalled that Stepien directed IGA to take Mayor Zimmer off the list of potential Democrat endorsements in January 2013, Renna said that the conversation with Kelly (about the Governor asking Mayor Zimmer to consider endorsing) happened in February 2013.

J. IGA Communications re: Mayor Mark Sokolich

Renna specifically recalled that Mayor Sokolich was on the list of potential Democrat endorsements "for a long time," but remembered Mayor Sokolich came off the list in April 2013. Ridley told Renna that Mayor Sokolich was not planning to endorse the Governor. At the time, Renna was not involved in obtaining Mayor Sokolich's endorsement, and had no specific knowledge about such efforts. Renna recalled Mowers asked Mayor Sokolich for his endorsement, but was not aware that Mowers was planning to ask Mayor Sokolich prior to Mowers' request for the Mayor's endorsement.

Renna said that IGA knew by April 2013 that Mayor Sokolich did not intend to endorse the Governor, and Renna's perception was that was fine. She recalled Mowers and Ridley continued to have an excellent relationship with Mayor Sokolich, even after IGA knew the mayor was not endorsing the Governor, at least up until August 2013, when Kelly communicated to Renna that she was upset about Ridley meeting with Mayor Sokolich.

1. June 5, 2013: Renna-Ridley Email re: Mayor Sokolich

Southwell questioned Renna about a June 5, 2013, email from Ridley to Renna, in which Ridley wrote, "meeting with the mayor of Fort Lee was one of the more interesting things I've witnessed in this job." Renna explained that Ridley routinely sent Renna emails to update her on his daily meetings. Renna did not recall having a substantive follow-up conversation with Ridley about that Mayor Sokolich meeting. Renna never met Mayor Sokolich, but she generally recalled that Mayor Sokolich was known to be a quirky, jubilant guy. Based on Renna's professional relationship with Ridley, Renna surmised that Ridley's characterization of that Mayor Sokolich meeting suggested that Ridley found Mayor Sokolich to be jovial and funny.

2. August 16, 2013: Ridley Meeting With Mayor Sokolich

Renna was questioned about an August 16-17, 2013 email exchange between Renna and Kelly wherein Kelly not happy that Ridley met with Mayor Sokolich. Relevant portions of the email exchange are below.

Kelly (8/16/13 at 10:54 p.m.): And why did [Ridley] think it was ok to meet with Sokolich?

Kelly (8/17/13 at 7:43 a.m.): [Ridley] should not have met with Fort Lee without approval. I'm really upset with him.

Renna (8/17/13 at 7:47 a.m.): I'm checking with Chris [Stark, IGA Regional Director] to see if [Ridley] asked him or not. I doubt he did...Chris would have flagged it with me, I'm sure. Will let you know.

Renna stated that she did not know why Kelly was angry with Ridley for meeting with Mayor Sokolich on August 16, 2013, and found Kelly's reaction "inexplicable." Renna recalled following up with another IGA staffer to see if Ridley had flagged the Mayor Sokolich meeting with him; the other IGA staffer did not know Ridley was taking the meeting with Mayor Sokolich. Renna said that she had no idea there was an issue with Mayor Sokolich at the time.

Renna stated that she did not ask Kelly why she was angry with Ridley for meeting with Mayor Sokolich, because the information flowed on a need-to-know-basis: if Kelly considered it important that Renna know why Kelly was upset with Ridley, Kelly would have shared that information with Renna. Renna stated that it would have been overstepping for her to ask for that information. Renna did not recall ever talking about it with other staff or learning from other sources why Kelly reacted angrily, but Renna explained that Kelly's reaction was not out of the ordinary, as it was normal for IGA management to be mad at a mayor without Renna knowing why.

Renna added that the August 16, 2013 meeting was the last meeting Ridley had with Mayor Sokolich. According to Renna, IGA did not engage in any outreach with Mayor Sokolich between Ridley's August 16, 2013 meeting with Mayor Sokolich and the Fort Lee traffic issue.

Renna explained that the full picture of the Renna-Kelly email chain was more convoluted than it seemed, because Renna recalled having performance issues with Ridley prior to August 16, 2013. For example, Renna was frustrated with Ridley for not sending her his schedule of meetings; and in addition, she had heard rumors that Ridley may have been faking having certain meetings (and subsequent recaps of the meetings) with local officials and instead taking time off from work. Renna even suspected that the August 16, 2013 "meeting" with Mayor Sokolich might have been fake, given Ridley's rote description of it.

Renna said that she did not want to throw Ridley under the bus in her conversation with Kelly, so she simply tried to placate Kelly.

Renna added that she had a follow up conversation with Ridley regarding his performance issues. Renna did not know if Kelly met with Ridley about either his lack of performance or Ridley's August 16, 2013 meeting with Mayor Sokolich.

Renna did not have any subsequent conversations on this subject with Kelly following the August 16-17, 2013 email exchange.

3. August 22, 2013: Email re: Fort Lee Regional Chamber of Commerce Breakfast

[On August 22, 2013, Renna received an email from Margaret Maclay, Director of the Fort Lee Regional Chamber of Commerce, inviting Lieutenant Governor Guadagno to address the Fort Lee constituency at an upcoming October 2013 luncheon. Renna forwarded the email to Kelly, who replied, "Should we do this in light of the Mayor?" Renna responded, "I guess not. It's a good Chamber, though." Kelly then said, "I assume the Mayor would go, no?" Renna answered, "Not necessarily if we don't tell him. He works, right?" Kelly responded, "Correct. Good call."]

During this timeframe, Renna recalled being in the process of lining up speaking engagements with various Chambers of Commerce. When asked why Renna responded to Kelly, "I guess not," Renna said it was in response to the immediate interchange with Kelly, wherein Renna inferred that Kelly had something against Mayor Sokolich and went along with it in her response to Kelly. Renna did not recall having any subsequent discussions with Kelly about the Fort Lee Regional Chamber of Commerce invitation.

II. Chronology of the George Washington Bridge Events

A. August 2013

Renna had no recollection of interactions between Kelly and Wildstein during August 2013. Furthermore, Renna said she had no knowledge of the August 13, 2013 email communications between Kelly and Wildstein.

B. September 9-13, 2013 – George Washington Bridge Lane Realignment

Renna stated she had no knowledge of the Fort Lee lane realignment at the time it started. Renna did not have any knowledge of inquiries about the traffic issues on September 9, 2013.

Regarding Kelly's September 9, 2013 email to Ridley ("Have you spoken to the Fort Lee Mayor?"), Renna was copied on the email, which Renna recalled was sent on their official Governor's Office email accounts.

1. September 12, 2013 – Renna's Email to Kelly About Mayor Sokolich

Renna recalled the events of September 12, 2013. Renna recounted that Ridley came to Renna's office and said he needed to talk to Renna about a call she had just taken from Mayor Sokolich. Renna recalled pulling out a notebook and taking notes as Ridley reiterated the conversation with the Mayor. Renna recalled Ridley saying that he had never heard Mayor Sokolich so angry; he said Mayor Sokolich used a lot of foul language and told Ridley that he needed to figure out what was going on.¹

Renna explained that it was her job to report the phone call to Kelly. Renna recalled hoping to speak to Kelly in person on September 12, 2013, but due to extenuating circumstances (the boardwalk fire in Seaside happened that day and Kelly was in a meeting). Renna sent Kelly an email outlining the conversation Ridley recounted with Mayor Sokolich. Renna added that her practice was normally to reach Kelly in person but otherwise she would email Kelly. Renna recalled thinking it was not important enough to call Kelly's cell.

Renna sent the email to Kelly recounting Ridley's angry call from Mayor Sokolich at 3:36 p.m. on September 12, 2013. Kelly did not respond to Renna's email about the Sokolich call until 11:44 p.m. that night. Renna recalled that between 3:36 p.m. and when Kelly responded at 11:44 p.m., Renna had been in communication with Kelly about the boardwalk fire, but not about Fort Lee. At the time, Renna was not aware that Kelly had forwarded Renna's email about Mayor Sokolich's angry call to Wildstein.

Renna woke up the next morning and saw Kelly's response from 11:44 p.m. In contrast to Renna's lengthy, 5-paragraph email to Kelly recounting Mayor Sokolich's call, Kelly responded with a single word: "Good." Renna recalled thinking it was a typical, cryptic response. Renna described Kelly's cryptic response as Kelly trying to act like Stepien.

Until December 12, 2013, Renna did not recall any later discussions with Kelly about the September 12, 2013 email or Mayor Sokolich's phone call.

Renna said that because she lives in south Jersey (Fort Lee is north New Jersey), she was not fully aware of the extent to which the traffic issue had been reported in the news

¹ In Renna's handwritten notes of Ridley's recounting the Mayor Sokolich call, Renna wrote "minutes from the council meeting," but Renna stated that she did not recall what that note refers to.

cycle until Ridley put the September 17, 2013 *Wall Street Journal* article about Fort Lee in the daily report. Renna recalled this was the first media report she saw on the Fort Lee traffic issue.

2. September 13, 2013 – IGA Staff Meeting and Patrick Foye's Email

Renna did not recall the September 13, 2013, IGA staff meeting Kelly assembled via email. Renna commented that typically, Kelly would not use email to gather all staff for a meeting. However, weekly IGA staff meetings usually occurred on Fridays (September 13, 2013 was a Friday). Renna said Kelly's email could be about anything.

Renna had no independent recollection of Patrick Foye's September 13, 2013 email or the Wall Street Journal article on the George Washington Bridge traffic issues. Renna did not recall having a conversation with Kelly about either Foye's email or the traffic issues.

C. October - December 2013

Renna stated she likely had brief conversations with her colleagues about the Port Authority board meetings and legislative hearings on the lane realignment, but she did not recall having any notable or substantive conversations about Fort Lee. Renna stated that she did not take note or pay attention to the Fort Lee issues until Wildstein was subpoenaed.

Renna recalled Wildstein's resignation in early December 2013. Renna did not recall having any conversations with Kelly about the Fort Lee events until December 12. Renna added that at this point in time, Kelly had kept Renna at arm's length. Renna recalled it was not unusual to go a full day without seeing or talking to Kelly.

D. December 12, 2013 – Kelly's Phone Calls to Renna

On the night of December 12, 2013, Kelly called Renna's cell phone while Renna was on the way home from dinner with her husband and three stepchildren. Renna noted that it was normal for Kelly to call Renna's cell if Kelly needed to get a hold of Renna, but by that point in time, Renna and Kelly did not speak frequently, so Renna suspected something had to be wrong for Kelly to call Renna at 9:00 p.m. Renna added that Kelly had not been in the office that day because Kelly had accompanied her oldest daughter to a medical appointment in Manhattan.

The following is Renna's recounting of the basic substance of the first telephone conversation with Kelly on the night of December 12, 2013:

Kelly: Do you have a minute to talk? I need you to walk me through the timeline as it relates to Fort Lee.

Renna: What does that mean?

Kelly: When did Mowers ask for the endorsement?

Renna: I don't recall. I wasn't involved or overseeing the [regional] team then...off the top of my head, April or May.

Kelly: Do you remember how he asked [for the endorsement]?

Renna: I wasn't involved; I remember hearing he just felt out the mayor, and he wasn't interested – that's all I can tell you.

Kelly: But it was spring?

Renna: Yes, I believe it was.

Kelly: Right. So this doesn't make any sense at all as it relates to the Bridge.

Renna: Right. Well if the Mayor is saying political retribution, Evan had had a great relationship with Mayor Sokolich, so it doesn't make sense.

Kelly: I know, that's what I told Kevin [O'Dowd]. I just wanted to make sure I had it right as far as timing goes, because you know, I didn't know anything about this.

Renna: Right. But, you know that the Mayor called Evan about it at some point – remember, he was F-bombing, etc.

[At this point, Renna indicated that Kelly immediately changed her tune.]

Kelly: Oh right, the email you sent me that I responded to with "good." Do me a favor and get rid of that.

Renna recalled thinking to herself that she had never been asked to do anything like delete an email before in the four years she had been with IGA. Renna said that the call dropped, and both Renna and Kelly tried to call each other back, and Kelly reached Renna first. Renna claimed that the two calls were like "Version 1" and "Version 2," in that Kelly's entire attitude and demeanor during the second call was completely different than the first call; in contrast to the first call, Kelly was nervous and talking fast. Renna recalled Kelly was not making sense. Here is Renna's recounting of the basic substance of the second telephone conversation with Kelly that same night:

Kelly: Well you know, Kevin called me today, and he really grilled me about this.

Renna: Okay, but you didn't know anything, you just knew from this [September 12] email right?

Kelly: Right, but he's asking me lots of questions about David [Wildstein], and it's just nerve racking, and I'm at the hospital with the kids...

Renna recalled Kelly then paused.

Kelly: You know Christina, if someone tells me something is okay, who am I to question them?

Renna: Right, if Bill or David say something—

Kelly: I don't need your vindication, Christina.

Renna recalled Kelly then cut her off, and Renna just let Kelly talk. Renna reiterated two additional things of note that she recalled hearing Kelly say.

First, Kelly commented that she felt okay about things because Senator Loretta Weinberg did not believe the Governor's Office was involved in the Fort Lee traffic issues.

Second, Kelly concluded the call by saying, "All I know is that if David [Wildstein] said there was a traffic study, I have no doubt there was a traffic study. Renna recalled answering, "Well right, it was a traffic study."

Shortly before the end of the second call, Renna recalled Kelly thanked Renna for letting Kelly vent. Renna finished the call sitting in the car parked in her driveway. Her husband and children went inside while Renna finished the call. After she hung up, Renna went inside and told her husband she had had an "unnerving" conversation with Kelly about the Fort Lee issue, but she did not recall sharing specifics of the conversation with her husband at that time.

Renna did not recall having a subsequent discussion with Kelly about the phone calls. Renna did not talk to anyone else about Kelly's request that Renna delete the September 12, 2013, email or about the December 12, 2013, calls with Kelly.

Renna told herself to sleep on Kelly's request to delete the September 12 email. The next morning, she complied with Kelly's request because Renna always did what Kelly asked her to do. However, Renna was so upset about Kelly's request that she decided to preserve a copy of the email by forwarding it to another personal Comcast email account before she deleted the original email from her Gmail account.

Renna thought she deleted the email from her Gmail account halfway through the day on December 13, 2013.

B. December 13, 2013

Renna recalled listening to the Governor's December 13, 2013, press conference but she was doing other things and was not watching closely.

E. January 7, 2014 – Renna's Conversation with Kelly About Fort Lee

On January 7, 2014, the day before Kelly's emails were released in *The Bergen Record*, Renna had a conversation with Kelly in Kelly's office to discuss personnel issues within IGA. Renna recalled Kelly saying, in sum or substance, "You know, I've been hiding under my desk nervous anytime someone walked in here with questions about Fort Lee, and I'm just happy it's dying down."

F. January 8, 2014

On the morning of January 8, 2014, Kieran Tintle called Renna in her office and told her to go to NJ.com. After Renna saw the headline, she told Tintle to come up to her office and further instructed him not to say anything to the rest of the staff. Renna said she then read the article and was shocked.

At some point after *The Bergen Record* story broke on January 8, 2014, Renna said Kelly called Renna's office line. Kelly was hysterically crying and said that she was sorry. Renna asked Kelly if she was going to come into the office, and Kelly said no. Kelly hung up and called Renna back at some point later in the day to ask Renna to log into Kelly's Twitter and delete Kelly's account, because people were tweeting "mean things" about Kelly. Renna said that she was unable to log on with the login information Kelly gave her. Kelly said that Kelly's mom had also been trying to log onto Kelly's Twitter and was similarly unsuccessful. Renna recalled that Kelly's Twitter account ended up being taken down, but Renna was not sure how it was deleted.

Later that day, on January 8, 2014, Kelly called Renna again. Renna recalled Kelly seemed calmer than during the previous two calls earlier that day. Renna said Kelly asked her about the State of the State RSVP's, and asked Renna to email the State of the State updates to a new email address. Kelly gave Renna the new email address and specifically asked Renna not to share the email address with anyone in IGA. Throughout the rest of the day, Renna sensed that Kelly was trying to just work normally.

G. January 9, 2014

Within the first hour of the day on January 9, 2014, Renna printed the September 12, 2013, email exchange with Kelly about Mayor Sokolich's call to Ridley and brought the email to Regina Egea. Renna explained to Egea why the email timestamp reflected December 12, 2013, and recounted Kelly's request that Renna delete the email. Renna recalled telling Egea that she was willing to talk to Chief Counsel Chris Porrino about the email, but she wanted Egea to also have it. Renna did not discuss the email with anyone in the Counsel's Office at that time.

Before the Governor's January 9 press conference announcing Kelly's termination, Kelly called Renna crying to say that she had been fired. Renna conveyed that she was also upset, as the whole situation was overwhelming. Renna recalled Kelly said, "I don't know what I'm going to do. You can't trust anyone, Christina."

Renna noted that this was the last time she spoke with Kelly on the phone. Shortly after they hung up the phone, Renna received a text from Kelly that said, "Sorry to tarnish IGA." Renna said that she responded to Kelly with something comforting, and Kelly answered that she was sorry. Renna said that this was the last time she communicated with Kelly.

Later that day, Renna asked the Regional Directors (Ridley, Chris Stark and Dominick Fiorilli) to come to Renna's office. During Renna's earlier meeting with Egea, Egea told Renna she would be asked to talk to someone in the Chief Counsel's Office about the September 12, 2013 email. Renna relayed to the Regional Directors that she would be talking to the Counsel's Office about certain things, and she wanted to ask the Regional Directors if they were aware of other related stories, in the event there might be other mayors coming out of the woodwork. Renna said she wanted to get the insight of the regionals before she spoke with the Counsel's Office.

Renna spoke to Porrino for two hours later that night about the Fort Lee events of which she was personally aware.

III. Superstorm Sandy Aid Allegations

Renna did not have a personal relationship with Mayor Dawn Zimmer. Within IGA, Ridley had a relationship with Mayor Zimmer. In contrast, Renna and Mayor Zimmer only met in passing. Renna recalled organizing a town hall event that Mayor Zimmer attended.

Renna's involvement in Hoboken was limited to hazard mitigation funding, not economic development projects. To Renna's knowledge, there was never a discussion within IGA about tying Sandy relief funding to development projects, or tying Sandy relief aid to a

local elected's support. Renna had no knowledge of Sandy relief aid being based on anything other than the merits.

A. February 2013: Dawn Zimmer's Meeting with the Governor

Renna recalled emailing David Glass (DEP Deputy Chief of Staff & Legislative Liaison) to set up the meeting between DEP and Mayor Zimmer, but after reviewing the email exchange to that effect, Renna surmised that the meeting referenced in Renna's email to Glass (wherein Renna says, "Late last week, Governor Christie met with Mayor Zimmer of Hoboken to discuss a whole host of issues") was probably the February 2013 meeting in which the Governor specifically asked Mayor Zimmer to consider endorsing. Renna said that she did not attend the meeting.

B. March 5, 2013: DEP Meeting with Dawn Zimmer

Renna recalled Mayor Zimmer sent a letter to IGA about flooding, but noted that a lot of towns reached out to IGA with flood mitigation proposals and plans. Renna said that she knew Mayor Zimmer had a large scale flood mitigation project that required the involvement of the Army Corps of Engineers. Renna recalled that Mayor Zimmer was throwing out enormous dollar figures for the project in an effort to get increased funding. Renna emphasized that the project sticks out in her memory as a flood mitigation project – not a development project.

Renna believed that Kelly asked Renna to set up the meeting between DEP Commissioner Martin, Department of Community Affairs Commissioner Constable, and Mayor Zimmer. Mowers also attended the meeting. Renna explained that this fell within her area of responsibility because she was overseeing both the Sandy operation and interdepartmental relations at that time. Renna did not recall discussing the meeting with Commissioner Martin or Commissioner Constable. Renna did not attend the meeting on March 5.

Prior to the meeting on March 5, 2013, Mowers sent an email to Renna asking if it was ok for the Rockefeller Group to be part of the meeting with Mayor Zimmer and the Commissioners. Renna recalled that she did not know who the Rockefeller Group was, and the only reason she remembers the Rockefeller Group now is because Renna went to Kelly to ask who the Rockefeller Group was. Renna recalled Kelly said that Lori Grifa represented the Rockefeller Group. Renna cannot recall if Kelly said whether it was or was not a problem for the Rockefeller Group to attend the meeting, but Renna said that she would not have made the decision for the Rockefeller Group to participate in the March 5, 2013 meeting without clearing it through Kelly. Renna's understanding was that the Rockefeller Group's participation had to do with the flood mitigation project and was therefore appropriate.

IV. Renna's Final IGA Observations

Renna described IGA as “amazingly non-partisan,” in that party affiliation was not a consideration within the Governor’s Office. Renna said that the IGA operation “needs to go back to its purest form” – focusing on building relationships and good government – and that, in her opinion, despite what may have happened during the reelection period in 2013, IGA is still 99% pure good government.

Renna characterized IGA as a department within a Governor’s Office that accomplished “truly amazing things” that the Governor could be proud of, and that the level of IGA’s communication to both Democrats and Republicans alike was unprecedented, and Renna heard this over and over from municipal governments across the state. Renna described the IGA operation as Bill Stepien’s brilliant brainchild that represented “fantastic government 99% of the time.” Renna added that the Sandy team in particular highlights IGA’s strengths as a completely non-partisan operation coordinating a broad outreach to elected officials across party lines, day in and day out.

V. Document Retention Notices

Renna received the document retention notices and is in compliance with them.