

**From:** [Michael Thabault](#)  
**To:** [Sherry Barrett](#)  
**Cc:** [Maggie Dwire](#); [Maricela Constantino](#); [Michelle Shaughnessy](#); [Seth Willey](#); [tracymelbiess@hotmail.com](mailto:tracymelbiess@hotmail.com); [Wendy Brown](#)  
**Subject:** Re: meeting with Utah  
**Date:** 11/14/2011 03:23 PM  
**For Follow Up:** Low Priority.

---

I think it is important to note that Jim K. did not really appreciate or understand until the very end of the meeting that we were trying to establish a way to protect the Mex wolf while simultaneously delisting those portion of the lupus range that are currently listed. The Ssp approach gives us the best opportunity to do that and he finally got it. Also, I stated we have not reviewed the UT plan in part because of focusing on core states of MT, ID, and WY but that we could not use the plan alone to delist because that was counter to the Act which says you can only delist due to recovery, extinction, or error.

Michael Thabault  
Assistant Regional Director - Ecological Services  
Mountain Prairie Region  
303-236-4252



▼ [Sherry Barrett/R2/FWS/DOI](#)

**Sherry  
Barrett/R2/FWS/DOI**

11/14/2011 02:12 PM

To: [Maricela Constantino/ARL/R9/FWS/DOI@FWS](#), [Michael Thabault/R6/FWS/DOI@FWS](#), [Michelle Shaughnessy/RO/R2/FWS/DOI@FWS](#)  
cc: [Wendy Brown/RO/R2/FWS/DOI@FWS](#), [Seth Willey/R6/FWS/DOI@FWS](#), [tracymelbiess@hotmail.com](mailto:tracymelbiess@hotmail.com), [Maggie Dwire/RO/R2/FWS/DOI@FWS](#)  
Subject: meeting with Utah 

Mike and Michelle: please let me know if I've portrayed issues correctly:

Hi Maricela: Yes, I attended.

The meeting was attended by:

Utah: Jim Karpowitz, Kevin Bunnell, Mike Styler, John Shivwitz, Alan Clark, Marty Bushman

Colorado (by Phone): Craig McGlaughlin, Jeff Verstieg  
FWS: Benjamin Tuggle, Noreen Walsh, Michelle Shaughnessy, Mike Thabault, Sherry Barrett

Benjamin committed to talking to states before moving the recovery plan forward - told them he wouldn't hit them with it cold. He also said that we are a long way off from changing the boundaries of the 10(j).

They noted that they didn't think Jim Heffelfinger was being treated fairly by rest of Recovery Team. I noted that Jim was working closely right now with Carlos Carroll and Jorge Servin on a habitat analysis in US and Mexico.

They feel strongly that Utah is not historical habitat and that FWS is only interested in having some kind of wolf there. They feel strongly that areas outside DPS's will be delisted.

Benjamin told them that we need Utah support to have recovery of Mexican wolves in Utah.

Michelle told them that nothing in the ESA talks about historical habitat. The range of a species constricts and expands. What is needed is to sustain a species into the future. Marty Bushman (Utah attorney) asked for cases of recovery outside of range. Michelle told him to look at the court cases on the wolf, where we were instructed to look at all suitable habitat and determine if it is significant. She told them that it's difficult to say that Utah and Colorado are not integral to *C. lupus*.

Mike Thabault said that FWS does not agree that we should have wolves everywhere, and that we are focusing on 3 wolf populations.

Benjamin told them that we are not going to focus recovery on backs of Colorado and Utah, but we're not saying that it's not important.

Michelle said that SPR is that portion of the range that is significant to the species, and a subspecies reclass would enable us to delist *C. lupus* and put a 10(j) designation to allow for management flexibility.

Jim Karpowitz said that 10(j) in Idaho did not provide for management flexibility to protect ungulates. Mike T. said that they were working on a revision to the 10(j) to allow for that management flexibility before the population was delisted. Jim Karpowitz said that they can't go 15 more years with the wolf protected.

Jim Karpowitz also said that Utah was not suitable habitat because there are livestock everywhere. He wants wolves delisted due to their management plan (and noted that FWS has had it for 6 years without reviewing it). Michelle said that the management plan would have to provide for recovery. Mike T. said that they had not reviewed it because they had been focusing on the other states.

In the end, Jim Karpowitz said that they are interested in talking more about subspecies and delisting and wants to work on agency trust. Kevin Bunnell said that they still want to send us something on why we should go DPS. We noted our short time frame for the rule. They were very appreciative of us travelling up there to meet with them. Larry Voyles called Benjamin after the meeting and said it was

a good meeting and that he thought Utah understood what we were saying.

Sherry Barrett  
Mexican Wolf Recovery Coordinator  
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service  
2105 Osuna Blvd NE  
Albuquerque, NM 87113  
Office phone 505.761.4748  
cell phone 505.363.2797

▼ Maricela Constantino/ARL/R9/FWS/DOI

**Maricela  
Constantino/ARL/R9/FWS/DOI**

To Wendy Brown/RO/R2/FWS/DOI@FWS,  
Sherry Barrett/R2/FWS/DOI@FWS

cc

11/14/2011 12:04 PM

Subject any word?

on the Nov 10th meeting?

---

Maricela A. Constantino  
Endangered Species Program  
Branch of Recovery and Delisting  
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service  
4401 N. Fairfax Drive  
Arlington, VA 22203

Remotely located at:  
2832 N. Staunton Rd  
Huntington, WV 25702  
blackberry: 571-969-9804  
email: maricela\_constantino@fws.gov